Education Review Office
TE TARI AROTAKE MATAURANGA

Careers Information, Advice, Guidance and Education (CIAGE) in Secondary Schools

August 2012

Contents

Overview

A key function of secondary schools is to prepare students for the future. A significant component of this function involves students achieving academic success. It also includes support for learners to develop the passions, goals and directions that will contribute to their families, society and the workplace. From this perspective, high quality careers information, advice, guidance and education (CIAGE) can help transform a young person's experience of schooling. Learners can become much more engaged in education and highly motivated about the future with a clear understanding of themselves and how they might live and work when they leave school.

In this evaluation ERO examined the approach of 44 secondary schools to CIAGE. Four schools had high quality approaches to CIAGE, characterised by their innovative school-wide focus on helping students identify, plan and strive for their aspirations for the future. The school-wide focus on student futures at these schools meant that students were well motivated to achieve their goals and had frequent opportunities to develop career management competencies. These schools also had high quality approaches with priority learners, especially Māori students and students with special needs.

The remaining schools in this evaluation did not have the same level of innovation or school-wide commitment to careers (or student aspirations for the future). These schools had a more conventional approach to careers that centred on the work of a careers department. These schools are divided into three groups – Conventional-Established, Conventional-Developing and Low Quality.

The Conventional – Established group comprised of 17 schools which provided familiar CIAGE opportunities for students in Years 9 to 13. This included initiatives such as:

- Year 9 students visiting the careers centre and completing a self-awareness unit in health
- Year 10 students developing a learning plan to inform their options for Year 11
- senior students visiting tertiary organisations and Year 13 students having individual interviews with a trained careers advisor.

Typically, the staff in the careers departments of the Conventional-Established schools were well organised and could demonstrate their success in terms of the development of student pathways. While staff understood the need for students to develop career management competencies, this was not a top priority for the school. In this regard, student aspirations or futures did not have the same level of focus as observed in schools with a high-quality, whole-school approach. This meant that students did not have the same day-to-day opportunities to consider their personal developmental and vocational goals, or the same opportunities to develop career management competencies.

The term Conventional - Developing describes the largest group of schools in this evaluation. Most of the students in these 19 schools did not have consistently good opportunities to set goals, develop self awareness, explore opportunities and make decisions about their future. Although the approach to CIAGE by these schools was linked to the career education guidelines, there remained significant areas in which they needed to improve their performance. Overall, the schools in this group did not demonstrate the same level of leadership and coordination, in terms of their pastoral and curriculum systems, as those schools with more developed approaches to CIAGE.

The schools in the last group had low quality approaches to CIAGE. These four schools required much more leadership in the careers department and/or across the school. Their focus for student career planning tended to be at Year 13 and there were no expectations for curriculum departments to develop careers-based units or classroom materials.

This is ERO's first national report on CIAGE since *The Quality of Career Education and Guidance in Schools* in 2006. That report used a different evaluation framework to that used in this evaluation. In this regard it is not possible to measure the extent of any systemic changes in Careers in the last 6 years. Despite this, the understanding school leaders have shown of career management competencies suggests that there has been a moderate system-wide improvement in schools' approaches to CIAGE. The fact that many schools were developing new CIAGE initiatives also provides some scope to expect improvement to continue.

Despite these positive factors, it was evident that significant system-wide improvements in CIAGE will require schools to move from having efficient careers departments to having innovative school-wide systems and processes that are consistent with those developed by a small group of schools in this evaluation. This potentially represents a significant shift for schools and policy-makers, as it involves a broad range of secondary school staff actively supporting students to develop career management competencies, and focussing on their futures.

Background: Careers, Information, Advice, Guidance and Education (CIAGE) policy and practice

At the beginning of 2012, the Ministry of Education (The Ministry) asked ERO to review careers information, advice, guidance and education (CIAGE) in secondary schools. ERO had previously reviewed Careers Education in 2006 and the Ministry was keen to build up evidence of current practice as part of its current review of CIAGE.[1] The Ministry's review is linked to the development of the Youth Guarantee policy and the Government's focus on ensuring that all young people make a successful transition from secondary schooling through to employment, education or training.

Careers Education in New Zealand

Careers education is mandated in New Zealand through the National Administration Guidelines. NAG 1(f) states that schools must:

> *provide appropriate career education and guidance for all students in Year 7 and above, with a particular emphasis on specific career guidance for those students who have been identified by the school as being at risk of leaving school unprepared for the transition to the workplace or further education/training.*

High quality CIAGE is also an implicit component of the National Education Goals (NEGs) for New Zealand's education system:

> *NEG 1*
> *The highest standards of achievement, through programmes which enable all students to realise their full potential as individuals, and to develop the values needed to become full members of New Zealand's society.*

> *NEG 3*
> *Development of the knowledge, understanding and skills needed by New Zealanders to compete successfully in the modern, ever-changing world.*

Similarly, the vision and principles of *The New Zealand Curriculum* have links to CIAGE through the development of confident, connected, actively involved lifelong learners.

> *Our vision is for young people:*
> * *who will be creative, energetic, and enterprising*
> * *who will seize the opportunities offered by new knowledge and technologies to secure a sustainable social, cultural, economic, and environmental future for our country*

---

[1] The terms of reference for the Ministry's review of CIAGE can be found at:
http://www.minedu.govt.nz/theMinistry/EducationInitiatives/YouthGuarantee/ReviewOfCareerInformationAdviceAndGuidance.aspx

- *who will work to create an Aotearoa New Zealand in which Māori and Pakeha recognise each other as full Treaty partners, and in which all cultures are valued for the contributions they bring*
- *who, in their school years, will continue to develop the values, knowledge, and competencies that will enable them to live full and satisfying lives*
- *who will be confident, connected, actively involved, and lifelong learners.*

The Career Education Guidelines

Careers New Zealand and the Ministry of Education have produced *Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools*. [2] These guidelines provide a framework for good practice in schools. They state that the main goal of career education and guidance is for students:

> *to develop the understandings, skills, and attitudes that they need to make positive career decisions throughout their lives.*

Significantly, *Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools* sets out a model of career education and guidance that emphasises the need for students to develop career management competencies. This represents a move away from career guidance based on vocational counsellors managing student exits from school and towards an approach in which students take more control of their lives. The career management competencies are set out in terms of the following categories:

- *Developing self awareness*
  Competencies that enable young people to understand themselves and the influences on them.

- *Exploring opportunities*
  Competencies that enable young people to investigate opportunities in learning and work, and relate them to themselves.

- *Deciding and acting*
  Competencies that enable young people to make and adjust their plans, to manage change and transition, and to take appropriate action.

The career management competencies can be linked to the key competencies of *The New Zealand Curriculum*. As Table 1 shows, schools can simultaneously develop student key competencies while developing their career management competencies.

Table1: Links between the career management competencies and the key competencies of The New Zealand Curriculum.

Career management competencies	Link to the key competencies
Developing self awareness	Involves managing self and relating to others.
Exploring opportunities	Requires students to think critically, use language, symbols, and texts, and relate to others.

---

[2] Ministry of Education. (2009) *Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools.*
http://nzcurriculum.tki.org.nz/content/download/2767/35051/file/Career-guidelines-web.pdf

Deciding and acting	Involves students thinking constructively and preparing to participate and contribute throughout their lives.

Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools (2009) discusses specific examples of how competencies can be developed in terms of The New Zealand Curriculum. Te Kete Ipurangi (TKI) also has information that schools can use about how career education can be integrated across the curriculum.[3]

Career Education Benchmarks

In addition to *Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools* (2009), schools have recently been able to use the Career Education Benchmarks[4] to support their self review of CIAGE. Careers New Zealand developed the benchmarks and published them in 2011. The use of these benchmarks was not a specific element of ERO's review, although most school leaders were aware of their publication and some had started to use the benchmarks to shape and review their performance.

The Quality of Career Education and Guidance in Schools (2006)

In 2006, ERO published *The Quality of Careers Education and Guidance in Schools*[5]. This evaluation examined the provision of career education and guidance programmes in all schools with students in Year 7 and above. There were 179 schools in the sample (145 primary and 34 secondary schools).

This evaluation asked questions about:

- the organisation and delivery of career education and guidance
- approaches to meet the career education and guidance needs of diverse students, including students at risk of leaving school unprepared for the transition to the workplace or further education/training
- career information processes
- professional development for staff specific to career education and guidance
- whānau and community involvement in career education and guidance
- the self review of career education and guidance.

ERO found that 11 percent of primary schools were providing high quality career education and guidance programmes for their Years 7 and 8 students. A further 59 percent were effective in some areas and needed to improve in other areas of the evaluation framework. Thirty percent needed to improve across all of the areas.

ERO found that 12 percent of secondary schools provided high quality career education and guidance to their students. A further 85 percent were effective in some areas and needed to improve in other areas. One secondary school needed to improve across all of the areas.

---

[3] http://nzcurriculum.tki.org.nz/Curriculum-resources/Learning-and-teaching-resources/Career-education/Whole-school-approach/Ideas-for-curriculum-areas

[4] http://www2.careers.govt.nz/educators-practitioners/planning/career-education-benchmarks/

[5] Education Review Office (2006) *The Quality of Careers Education and Guidance in Schools*. Wellington: Education Review Office.

The strongest areas of performance for secondary schools were:

- their provision of careers information and resources
- having dedicated staff for career education and guidance
- providing staff with professional development.

The weakest areas of performance for secondary schools were:

- meeting the career education and guidance needs of the diverse groups of students in their school
- involving family/whānau and community in career education and guidance programmes
- reviewing the effectiveness of career education and guidance activities.

Methodology

In the 2012 evaluation, ERO reviewed the approach to careers information, advice, guidance and education (CIAGE) at 44 secondary and composite schools. These schools represented a variety of deciles and sizes. Two of the schools were wharekura. In this sample of 44 schools there were more large and very large urban secondary schools compared to the national percentage.

The central question guiding the review team was:

> *To what extent do New Zealand secondary schools have an effective approach to career information, advice guidance and education (CIAGE) for all students?*

Reviewers also collected information about each school's:

- approach to developing the career management competencies of students
- CIAGE mechanisms, structures and/or processes
- leadership of CIAGE
- staff skills, knowledge and understanding of CIAGE
- relationships with employers and other educational institutions in the provision of CIAGE
- relationships with families/whānau in the provision of CIAGE
- self review of CIAGE
- strengths and barriers in CIAGE

A detailed set of indicators was developed to guide reviewer judgements in the collection of information for this evaluation. These indicators are summarised in the findings section and set out in more detail in Appendix 1. Included in these indicators were such aspects as:

- CIAGE is an essential component of the school that is actively supported by the school's leaders.
- Through CIAGE, the school aims to ensure that **every student** goes on to further education, training or employment.

- CIAGE is consistent with effective practice in career education guidelines, including the focus on students developing career management competencies, the need for school-wide teamwork and coordination, and the personalisation of career advice and guidance.
- The school has processes in place that support the career education and guidance of Māori, Pacific, special needs and students at risk of under-achievement.
- The school has links to the other institutions, businesses and the wider community that help students to develop self awareness, explore opportunities and plan for their future.

This review did not focus on the outcomes of CIAGE in secondary schools. CIAGE outcomes, across the sample schools, would have required a more longitudinal approach than was possible in this evaluation. Where schools had information about the quality of their CIAGE this was considered by review officers.

As part of this evaluation review officers met with school leaders, the leaders of careers departments, teachers, students and, in some cases, board members and whānau. Individual review officers spent up to two days in each school. Where available, outcome data and self-review information were used to inform the overall evaluation.

Findings

ERO found four types of approaches to careers education. This section discusses each of these approaches in detail. The approaches are summarised in the table below.

Table 2: Four different approaches to CIAGE

Whole-School High Quality	4 schools had innovative school-wide approaches to student futures. Through the integration of CIAGE these students regularly supported students to develop set goals, explore opportunities and make decisions.
Conventional Established	17 schools had careers departments that provided some opportunities for students in CIAGE. These initiatives were driven by the school's careers department and did not extend across the school's curriculum departments.
Conventional Developing	19 schools had limited opportunities for students to set goals, develop self awareness, explore opportunities. CIAGE systems and processes were also driven by the school's careers departments – although these schools had yet to develop the same level of organisation as the schools in the categories above.
Low quality	4 schools had low quality CIAGE systems and processes typically focussed on Year 13 destinations and little else. CIAGE at these schools was typically characterised by leadership difficulties either in the Careers department or in the school's senior management.

Schools with a 'Whole-School High Quality' approach to CIAGE

The CIAGE systems and processes at four schools stood out in this evaluation. These schools demonstrated a school-wide, coordinated and innovative focus on helping students identify, plan and strive for their aspirations for the future. They had a range of curriculum and pastoral systems in place to support this work which meant that students had frequent opportunities to develop career management competencies.

These four schools were of different types; a large high decile coeducation high school in Auckland; a small urban wharekura; a large high decile coeducational school in the South Island; and an urban, low decile girls' college.

Leadership and the status of 'student futures'

The leadership of these schools ensured that student aspirations had a high status across the school. In discussing the increasing importance of CIAGE at one school, a principal explained their school's focus had developed after a significant shift in thinking by staff. Having realised that only a minority of students go on to university, teachers had seen the need for the school to move away from a focus on students attaining university entrance. They recognised that the curriculum also needed to work for students who were not on academic pathways. As a result, enterprise across the curriculum and a school-wide emphasis on authentic learning was introduced. This approach has provided ongoing opportunities for students to explore learning that is relevant to the workplace.

Systems and initiatives

The focus on student futures at these schools made CIAGE a central component of both curriculum and pastoral systems. In pastoral systems, all of these schools had developed initiatives to ensure that form teachers (or equivalent) built a solid understanding of the interests and strengths of students in their form class. Two of these schools have used school-wide vertical form classes to develop the relationships between form teachers and their form class. The advantage of a vertical structure meant that a form teacher could develop a full understanding of the 'whole student' during their time at school. One of these schools used a vertical form class with Māori and Pacific students to ensure that good relationships were developed between these students and their form teacher.

The use of vertical form classes was one of the strategies used to build connections with families and a student's career aspirations. The involvement of parents was especially strong at two of the schools in this group. Parental involvement was linked to the goal-setting processes used by students and meetings that would include parents as part of the process of finalising student aspirations. The other two schools used more conventional methods to inform parents of CIAGE processes and concentrated on working with the parents of specific groups of students, i.e. Māori, Pacific and those with special needs.

The high quality approach of this group of schools meant that students had regular and ongoing opportunities in the curriculum to develop self awareness, reflect on their goals and explore options. For example, two of these schools had placed particular emphasis on making the curriculum authentic and meaningful for students. At one of these schools, the following links were discussed by three departmental heads:

The technology department head has built strong links with an Industry Training Organisation (ITO) as well as three local tertiary institutions. He routinely liaises with business specialists/experts and invites people in to class to speak with students. He also works closely with the careers coordinator to provide students with work experience and STAR[6] courses linked to their interests.

The head of commerce promotes visits from local business owners and encourages a business-mentoring scheme for interested students at the school. There is a careers module within the Year 9 course that promotes the use of the school's Pacific student mentors for junior students. The classroom programmes provide authentic business-world style learning for students, including a business challenge module similar to the television idea 'Dragon's Den'.

The science head has ensured that every science unit contains contexts that have relevant links to the real world. He says that this approach has promoted increased student engagement and interest in the sciences as they see the relevance of this both to themselves and 'the real world'.

At another school, the overall range of careers-based curriculum initiatives included:

- careers education programmes delivered by careers staff as part of social studies and health in Years 9 and 10; and in English at Year 11
- careers seminars for Year 13 students jointly run by the careers and academic departments
- a school-wide focus on authentic teaching and making learning relevant and linked to the world of work
- establishing blocks of time during the term that support classes to undertake large scale, problem-based and authentic (real world) learning
- a wide-ranging set of curriculum choices in the senior school which provide a focus on trades, pre-employment and transition to work
- work experience for Year 10 students with opportunities for seniors to take short courses using STAR funding.

All the schools in this group had curriculum processes that started from Year 9 (when students first entered the school). Similarly, they were also integrated with, or at least complemented, the future focus of each school's pastoral system. The most compelling example of this was seen at the wharekura where student goals had become the driving force for an individual student approach to the curriculum and the construction of the timetable. The following example describes in detail how this operated.

---

[6] Secondary-Tertiary Alignment Resource, for more information see
http://www.minedu.govt.nz/NZEducation/EducationPolicies/Schools/Initiatives/STAR.aspx

Innovation in supporting student futures at an urban wharekura

During Week 1 of Term 1 each student focuses on developing or reviewing their *Learning Plan*. At Years 9 and 10 there is a broader approach and the plan becomes more focused and specific as students move through Years 11, 12 and 13. Students spend a day on developing the plan during the first week of the school year and the students then have an additional three weeks to develop this plan. Teachers help individual students to:

- identify their passions

- refine these into more specific goals

- list their achievements to date

- identify what their next steps are in order to achieve their goals

- identify potential mentors for workplace internships (Years 11 – 13)

- list the 'big questions' they are still seeking answers for associated with their aspirations

- list subjects needed and numbers of credits they need to acquire

- develop indicators of success (how will I know I have achieved?).

Kaiarahi (mentor teachers) see their role as helping students to gain the skills needed to manage their *Learning Plans* rather than making decisions for them. Teachers provide advice on subject prerequisites and on drawing up an individual timetable plan. The timetable at the wharekura is in modulars so students can study in classes at, below or above their year level. Students choose the combination of courses and modules that will support their future plans. As a result, a student may only take the modules required by their *Learning Plan*. This means that if they do not need a full year's course they are free to take other modules in the school's timetable.

A careers focus day is also held during the first week of Term 1. This day includes outside speakers and vocational displays. Students use this time to seek out information relevant to their Learning Plans.

During Week 4 all students present their *Learning Plan* to their whānau, supported by their kaiarahi. As part of this process whānau investigate ways in which they support their child's aspirations. Sometimes kaiarahi have a mediator's role when whānau do not fully understand or support the student's aspirations.

In Week 9 students present their 'exhibitions' on themselves, their life journey and their aspirations, to the whānau arahi (year group), supported by their whānau. Parents spoken to by ERO indicated that this could be a very moving occasion.

In Term 2, students make contact with employers in fields relevant to their *Learning Plans*. They set up internships, with the help of kaiarahi, which take place for one day a week during the remainder of Term 2. What students learn though the internships is used to review their *Learning Plans* and refine their understanding of their tentative career aspirations.

Priority learners

The coordinated CIAGE processes of these schools were also evident in how they worked with priority or 'at-risk' learners. Overall, the individualised approach these schools took to student futures meant that additional support was given to students who were struggling. For example, if a form teacher identified that a student was having difficulty developing their aspirations for the future then specialist careers advice was put in place as a natural next step.

In three of these schools specific initiatives were established to support and/or involve the families of Māori and Pacific students. Strong pastoral systems were an important basis for this work. Having one form teacher in a vertical form structure has made it easier for all parents, including the parents of Māori and Pacific students, to make contact with the school. The use of marae as a venue for hosting Māori parents and the use of liaison officers to connect with Pacific parents were among the initiatives used to include families.

One school developed a Pacific student leadership scheme that promoted junior Pacific students to achieve with the help of successful senior mentors. This initiative also made it easier for this school to build links between its Pacific student cohort and tertiary education providers. It also underpinned the Pacific students homework centre.

Another school had developed a set of procedures for work experience and transition for students with special needs. This was developed by the school's transition department in partnership with staff from the special needs unit. A letter home to parents explained that this transition process extended the school's Individual Education Plan (IEP) process. Other documentation set out how the school intended to work with employers to ensure that students were successfully placed.

> *[Students'] focus is now on preparing for their future; for what they can do when they leave school and in some cases, leave home.*
> (School's management documentation for transitioning students with special needs.)

Staff expertise

An important feature of these schools was the level of staff expertise and training. All the Careers Advisors (or equivalent) at each school were well qualified and/or experienced. For example, one had a Post-Graduate Certificate while the others had experience or professional development indicative of good practice.

More important than the actual qualifications of the careers' staff was each school's overall professional expertise or development linked to supporting student futures. For example, a key skill for careers leaders was the support they could provide to the school's form teachers and deans. It was also important that they could, as far as possible, lead any school-wide initiatives in CIAGE. In work with individual students it was evident that career's staff needed to have strong interpersonal skills, especially in working with priority learners.

An important feature of these four schools was the expertise of form and subject teachers. Staff at these schools had typically often benefitted from effective and ongoing school-wide professional development which linked CIAGE to teachers' pastoral care and curriculum roles. For example, teachers from the kura had had considerable professional development linked to a school-wide development plan, including a focus on helping students to identify

their aspirations. The kura's staff had also benefitted from high levels of involvement from Careers New Zealand. Teachers from another school had received extensive professional development on enterprise or authentic learning.

One of the schools in this group had previously been involved in the Ministry of Education's CPaBL training (Creating Pathways and Building Lives 2006-2008), while another had been part of the Designing Careers initiative (2006-2007).

Community relationships

The schools with high quality approaches to CIAGE had good relationships with their wider communities, including businesses, employers and agencies such as Careers New Zealand. These relationships were developed across the school and were not just limited to staff in the careers department. For example, two of the schools require students themselves to make connections with employers to set up work experience and mentoring relationships.

One of these schools, through its focus on enterprise learning, had established many links between curriculum departments and local employers. These were used to develop authentic learning activities across the curriculum.

Self review

Self review was an established process at each of these schools. However there was room for improvement regarding their self review of CIAGE. The wharekura's self review had led to the development of the whole-school process focussed on student futures. Their review involved consultation with staff, students and whānau and a recognition that too many students were leaving the kura with insufficient preparation for their next steps in life.

The kura analysed and reported on the quality of the student *Learning Plans* and, at the time of ERO's visit, were in the process of developing a more coordinated approach to reviewing their overall process to student futures.

Other examples of positive self-review practices included the use of regular meetings between careers leaders and senior management to discuss CIAGE at the school. Surveys were also used to help monitor how well form teachers were dealing with their CIAGE responsibilities. One school used CIAGE appraisal goals within teacher performance agreements to ensure good practices were a focus for work and development.

Some tracking of school leavers identified their destinations. This information was not analysed to the same extent as NCEA data and typically did not lead to consistent changes in practice. Other tracking also occurred such as parental attendance at goal-setting meetings and academic counselling.

There was some annual reporting to the board. The wharekura had clear targets linked to student *Learning Plans*. The remaining schools were not as advanced in setting targets and goals linked to student pathways or career management competencies.   The board reports of the other schools typically offered more detailed reporting about Gateway and STAR spending.

Schools with a 'Conventional-Established' approach to CIAGE

Seventeen of the 44 schools in this evaluation had what has been described as Conventional-Established systems for developing student pathways. These schools did not have the same degree of school-wide CIAGE processes as the schools from the above category. These schools did have hard-working and efficient careers departments which ensured that there was careers education, advice and guidance, in some form, from Years 9 to 13.

A key difference between schools judged to be Conventional-Established and those with a Whole-School High Quality approach was their level of innovation. In general, Conventional-Established schools had taken fewer risks in structuring CIAGE systems and processes. While many of the leaders and careers advisors at these schools understood the concept of supporting student futures this was not as well understood across their staff.

In this regard, the effective links between pastoral care, curriculum systems and CIAGE were not as evident at Conventional-Established schools. For example, form teachers or student mentors were not as well equipped to provide individual support and guidance to students. This meant that CIAGE responsibilities were far more centred around the careers departments than they were at the high quality schools.

Conventional-Established schools were more focused on ensuring that individual students had developed sound pathways. They had less focus on students developing career management competencies or planning their individual futures. In this sense, CIAGE resources were targeted more at students transitioning through the school rather than developing their aspirations and building up experience for their possible futures.

Leadership

The principals and careers advisors at Conventional-Established schools were generally well regarded and effective leaders in the school. The senior management had good links with career staff and had typically contributed to CIAGE having a good profile across the school. All of these schools had experienced careers advisors who had developed good systems and processes.

The leadership or status of careers in these schools did not generally extend to it being a central or key focus as it was for the schools with a high quality approach. Rather, CIAGE was an important rather than a key aspect of the school programme for Conventional-Established schools.

Systems and processes

The Conventional-Established schools had many similarities in terms of their CIAGE systems and processes. Typically they had some form of careers education across the curriculum, albeit in discrete teaching units within health, social studies or English courses. They usually had a well developed approach to Gateway and STAR courses. Links with the school's pastoral systems provided support for students identified as needing careers advice and guidance.

Some form of academic counselling was underway at many of these schools. However it was often a relatively new initiative and had not yet become a consistently effective process. In several cases, these schools were struggling to have form teachers trained at a sufficient level

to deliver CIAGE. One school, which had developed the skills of its form teachers, had been using Careers New Zealand to train form teachers over the preceding three years. This had been effective in helping form teachers develop the skills to be useful 'learning coaches' who could have discussions with individual students about their career plans and subject choices.

The similarity of approach found at most of the Conventional-Established schools is captured in the example below. This description demonstrates many of the types of systems and processes that were used for CIAGE at most of these schools.

A representative approach from a Conventional-Established CIAGE school

Careers education is provided at each year level (from Year 9 to 13). It is timed to support subject choice and applications for tertiary education. The Careers Advisor has considered the need for students to develop the career management competencies – but this is not an explicit part of the programme. The main components of the school-wide approach to CIAGE include:

- career-related programmes/modules in the curriculum
- access to careers information (online and via hard-copy resources)
- course and options counselling within the school
- assistance for individuals or small groups making career decisions
- supporting priority learners.

Students have access to print and online careers resources with eight computers for student use in the careers area. Although the school has several computer suites they are usually timetabled for specific subjects such as media studies and computing. Access is difficult when all students at a particular year level need to use websites to explore courses and careers. The school has set up a system whereby form classes are rotated through the computer suites to provide access to online resources.

The careers leader uses the school's newsletter to provide a steady stream of careers-based information – especially for Year 13 students. A careers handbook for Year 13 students and their parents outlines career choices, how university is different from high school, budget advice, loans and allowances, flatting, halls of residence and scholarships. The school has also established a Facebook page for Year 13 students to discuss the transition to tertiary education and their career pathways.

There are no specific CIAGE initiatives for Māori and Pacific students. Māori and Pacific learners are typically supported as individuals. The school's Māori studies leader has previously arranged meetings for involving Māori parents, careers staff and a university. Careers staff liaise with the school's deans and provide CIAGE for individual priority learners when required.

In terms of CIAGE across the curriculum, the school has put in place something for students at each year level. Students in Years 9 and 10 tend to concentrate on activities that will help develop their self awareness while those in the senior school are more focused on exploring options and making decisions.

In **Year 9**, there is an introduction visit to the Careers centre. At the end of the year students have an opportunity to use computer software such as Future Indicative and the Real Game to support their thinking about options.

In **Year 10,** students complete a learning and career plan based on the programme developed when the school was involved in the Ministry's 2007-08 career's initiative *Designing Careers*. The work is timed around subject selection, is entered on the school's data system and is supported by form teachers in extended form times.

A careers unit in social studies covers self awareness (interest, skills, values, motivators, personality), job opportunities, world of work map (things, ideas, people, data), personality types and qualities wanted by employers, and why we go to school.

There are also visits from Careers New Zealand staff and motivational speakers at Year 10 assemblies.

Careers education for **Year 11** students includes mentoring within extended form periods, and the updating of their learning plan. Students in some courses such as hospitality, employment skills, applied mathematics, Gateway and employment skills have a small careers component, which could include work experience and/or visiting speakers from employers and tertiary providers.

The **Year 12** programme includes assemblies with Careers staff and outside speakers, and a focus on financial planning.

Year 13 students have specific newsletters and seminars e.g. about halls of residence, visits from tertiary liaison staff, Industry Training Organisations (ITOs), assemblies with Careers staff and outside speakers, and a Facebook page for notices and questions about Careers. The programme has recently been modified because of the increasing number of non-academic students in Year 13.

Priority learners

Conventional-Established schools had a few small-scale initiatives for Māori and/or Pacific students. They did not tend to have specific initiatives for students with special needs.

Most of the schools in this group sent students to Māori career exhibitions and any relevant tertiary liaison days. A minority of schools also had Careers New Zealand presentations on site specifically for their Māori students. One school had a specific Māori parents evening which involved an informal meal and a presentation from a Māori liaison officer from a tertiary institution.

Another school had developed career education plans for both Māori and Pacific learners. These school-wide plans had been developed as part of the school's *He Kakano* goals. Facilitators from Careers New Zealand and other community experts, developed workshops to support Māori and Pacific students to develop future pathways. The school ensured that each student had a specific career plan, which was developed with the help of information from the school's career planning software. In developing the plans, the school's career's advisor met with each student and then with their whānau/families. The careers programmes were reviewed and included student evaluations of the workshop processes. Students were

very supportive of the approach taken by the school and wanted to meet more regularly in their respective groups.

One of the schools in this group was a small, rural wharekura. The approach of this kura reflected some important qualities required in working with Māori students. For example, the entire staff helped to ensure that all students had clear goals for their future. These goals were recorded in a school diary and were understood, not just by a form teacher, but by all the secondary school staff. Students who had difficulty in developing their aspirations had ongoing support from the principal and staff. Whānau were also involved in these discussions to help ensure that these aspirations reflected those of the whānau.

Students were supported in their whānau-linked aspirations by the school's part-time careers advisor who actively helped find pathway information for each student. The school's senior students also visited each of the campuses relevant to their career pathway. They met their potential teachers and made links with both the current students and any whānau members who may have lived nearby. Students and staff at the wharekura stressed the importance of students having a network around them when they transitioned to tertiary education. While part of this was linked to concepts of manākitanga and whānaungatanga, staff and students also emphasised the large leap involved in moving from a small rural town to a distant metropolitan university. In this regard, the comments from students at this rural wharekura echoed those of students at other rural secondary schools in this evaluation.

Community relationships

Conventional-Established schools typically had a range of relationships with community members reflecting positive links with tertiary organisations and local businesses. These relationships tended to be developed through the careers department. No schools in this group, including the wharekura, had links with iwi that could contribute to students' pathways and career management competencies.

Links with tertiary providers involved open days and liaison visits. Similarly, most of the links with work experience came through the school's Gateway programmes as well as some small work-experience opportunities that a few schools had developed as part of more vocational courses.

Most of these schools had a high number of employers to call in for Gateway placements and could show evidence of positive feedback on the students who had taken part in work placements.

Staff expertise

Approximately half of the Conventional-Established schools had careers advisors with a formal qualification. This included qualifications from the Nelson Marlborough Institute of Technology (NMIT) and the Auckland University of Technology (AUT). Most schools also had a connection to a professional cluster and/or went to careers conferences or other professional development. Significantly, most schools, through their leader or careers staff, emphasised that personal and professional qualities, such as being able to communicate well with a range of young people, were more important than formal qualifications.

Significantly ERO found that schools in either the Whole-school, high quality or Conventional-Established groups were more likely to have been part of two Ministry of

Education professional development projects for CIAGE - Creating Pathways and Building Lives (2007 and 2008) and Designing Careers (2006-2007), compared to those with lower quality approaches to CIAGE.

Self review

Schools in the Conventional-Established group had variable approaches to self review. In some cases they did little data gathering, analysis or reflection on the school's approach to CIAGE. In a few cases the self-review processes were based on good levels of evidence and able to provide useful analysis for ongoing improvements.

A few schools in this group had more thorough self-review (in some ways) than schools in the more innovative group above. This may reflect the overall level of establishment of their CIAGE systems and processes compared to the relatively new and innovative work of the Whole-School High Quality group.

Most schools in the Conventional-Established group also had some form of student destination information although this was usually incomplete and not analysed. Three schools had information that was useful for self-review purposes. One of the schools in this group also followed up on students in employment and tertiary courses to check on the success of these transitions.

Despite these examples, the self-review data collected and analysed by schools was generally patchy and not organised into useful, systematic analyses of the school's CIAGE. Some surveys were carried out about careers integration in departments. Such an approach was insightful in at least one case where it revealed very big differences in how careers education was taught across a school. ERO identified that in some of these schools there were no guidelines for departments to integrate careers and this made it difficult to review the performance of the school in this regard.

Most of the schools had also read and/or been to Careers New Zealand presentations about the benchmarks and were preparing to use them in future self review.

Schools with a 'Conventional-Developing' approach to CIAGE

Nineteen of the 44 schools were judged Conventional-Developing in their approach to CIAGE. Aspects of the good practice demonstrated by the previous groups of schools were found in these schools but they were not consistently evident.

Leadership

Some of the schools in this group were in transition with the recent or pending appointment of a principal. The new principals usually understood what changes were required but had not yet made the necessary changes. While students were generally well supported across many aspects of developing learning pathways, these schools were at the beginning of the process of developing a coherent approach to careers education, including the development of students' career management competencies.

In some of these schools senior leaders did not have strong links to the careers staff. Some schools also provided a limited amount of time for the careers advisor to carry out their responsibilities.

Systems and processes

The focus in these schools was on providing students with information about their possible future careers and informing their subject choices rather than developing career management competencies. Students had access to appropriate computer applications such as CareerQuest to assist them to identify potential pathways. Often comprehensive careers related course information was provided to students in booklet form or discussed with groups at careers evenings. Overall, most students, over the course of their time at school, were provided with useful support and advice.

These schools demonstrated considerable variability in the nature and extent of the types of in-class programmes they offered to students in Years 9 to 10. In many schools very little was provided at Year 9. At Year 10, a minority of schools developed units that either encouraged self awareness or provided an opportunity to investigate possible careers. A minority of these schools provided careers exhibition days and university visits for selected groups of students.

The CIAGE focus for these schools at Years 11 and 12 included parents' evenings with a Careers New Zealand speaker; careers interviews; open days and work experience. Apart from Gateway programmes and courses focused on transition or employment skills, there were few opportunities in the curriculum for students to develop career management competencies.

Most of these schools interviewed all their Year 13 students and the destinations of these students were collated. Significantly, most of these schools did not provide careers interviews for students at other levels, including at Year 12. Interviews for these groups tended to be at the student's request or in response to a request from staff working within the school's pastoral care systems.

Parents were provided with some opportunities for meaningful input into planning student pathways. Information was shared with parents at report evenings and careers staff were available to meet with individual parents if requested. However, schools did not take a proactive approach to involving parents in goal setting and monitoring student progress along their selected pathways.

In a few schools there was an expectation that departments would include CIAGE in their curriculum documents. In these schools some curriculum areas may have incorporated aspects of CIAGE into their programmes but this was not universal. Departmental management documents, in most schools, made no reference to CIAGE. If there was some expectation of teacher involvement in CIAGE, staff usually lacked the skills and knowledge to enable them to engage with students on CIAGE. Careers education was not seen as part of the classroom teacher's role and staff had received little professional development on their role.

Priority learners

Some of the Conventional-Developing schools had a strong focus on meeting the needs of students identified as being at risk of leaving school inadequately prepared for future learning or employment, including Māori and Pacific students. For these groups individual goal setting and close monitoring of learning pathways was a feature, particularly of the Transition

department. Some of these students would also be referred by deans and other staff with pastoral care responsibilities.

Community relationships

Schools in the Conventional-Developing group tended, as with the Conventional-Established group, not to have innovative links with iwi, tertiary providers or businesses. Most of the careers-based community relationships were linked to tertiary liaison and Gateway placements. The extent of the Gateway programmes at the Conventional-Developing schools tended to be smaller than that for the schools in the first groups.

Staff expertise

Many of the careers advisors in this group of schools had an insufficient understanding of the current approach to CIAGE. Some had been in the position for a considerable period of time and not kept up with current practice. Others were newly appointed and while familiar with current expectations on CIAGE, had not yet made an impact on school practice. Some advisors were not trained teachers and lacked the status with other staff to affect the necessary change. Most did not hold formal careers qualifications but had developed useful professional knowledge and skills through active membership of Careers and Transition Educators of Aotearoa, NZ (CATE).

Self review

Self review of CIAGE was very limited at the Conventional-Developing schools. It was not usually based on an analysis of student destinations or retention rates and tended to be anecdotal and descriptive. There was one exception, where a school in this group had put together self-review information that included student leaver data and careers-related programme outcomes.

Schools with a 'Low Quality' approach to careers

ERO found low quality CIAGE in four schools. These schools lacked a coherent, focused plan for providing students careers education and guidance. In all but one of these schools there were no guiding documents for careers. Staff with careers responsibilities operated in isolation from each other and the rest of the school. No particular provision was made for priority groups such as Māori and Pacific. In the case of two schools good practices that had been previously developed from their participation in Creating Pathways and Building Lives (CPaBL) had not been sustained.

In all of these schools there had been significant instability in the staffing of the careers area. One school, for example, had appointed four different careers advisors since 2009. The current careers advisor had not seen the recent careers documents, and neither had the principal. In another school the careers advisor, who was in acting role, had only two hours a week allocated on the timetable for her careers work.

All but one of these schools had seen recent changes in senior leadership. One school had appointed four principals in four years and another three in three years. In one of these schools, the changes in leadership and careers advisors had resulted in a shift from participation in CPaBL to little evidence remaining of the positives initiatives implemented at that time. The careers team was inactive and even a careers link box had been removed from planning templates.

The major focus of careers education at these schools was at Year 13, where individual student interviews were typically used to support students. Students in Years 9 to 12 were not provided with comprehensive careers information. Course selection books did not link courses to careers advice and guidance, and careers information was not promoted at course selection evenings.

Little in-class development of careers knowledge or the career management competencies happened at Years 9 and 10. At Year 11, one school held a careers intensive day. In another school, students participated in a ten hour compulsory Year 11 careers unit. Student feedback on this unit was negative.

At Years 11 and 12, STAR and Gateway programmes were often implemented independently of the careers advisor. All schools had well established positive links with employers and tertiary providers through these programmes.

No formal expectations were in place for departments to provide students with careers education. The careers advisors were also unaware of what careers education might be happening in classrooms. Trade-based subjects, in particular the technologies, were more likely to provide some careers information within their programmes.

Conclusion

This report shows that for schools to have high quality careers, information, advice, guidance and education (CIAGE) there needs to be a school-wide focus that supports students to have regular, coordinated and ongoing opportunities to develop career management competencies. Significantly, the schools that ERO found to have the highest quality approaches to CIAGE were focussed not just on the pathways or vocations of students but on their individual futures. These schools had well trained staff across the school – not just careers advisors but also deans and form teachers. These staff had developed excellent relationships with students and actively supported them to develop goals, understand themselves, investigate opportunities and make decisions.

In addition to the pastoral care relationships and systems, schools with high quality approaches had curriculum structures or initiatives that also helped students develop career management competencies. These included careers-based units in social studies, English or health classes, and authentic learning opportunities that linked students with workplaces and/or the types of authentic learning activities they might experience in 'the real world'.

The majority of schools had active careers departments that, while not innovative, had put in place a range of conventional CIAGE initiatives. Seventeen of these schools were judged to have a Conventional-Established approach to CIAGE. Most of these schools had some processes for identifying student goals, albeit that they were much more focused on developing student pathways. While school leaders were familiar with career management competencies, students did not have the same opportunities to regularly focus on their passions, goals and opportunities for the future.

Another 19 schools had also taken a conventional approach to careers. Careers, information, advice, guidance and education (CIAGE) at Conventional-Developing schools did not have the same profile and/or level of coordination and leadership of CIAGE at schools with better quality approaches. Many of these schools had useful support for students in pockets across the school. However, CIAGE was fragmented at these schools but many could be expected to improve their performance over time, especially as new careers initiatives become established and pastoral care and curriculum areas of the school take more responsibility for the pathways of students.

Four schools seemed unlikely to improve without significant change in their approach and/or personnel.

Has there been a change in schools' approach to CIAGE since 2006?

In 2006, ERO examined the following aspects of schools' career education:

- the organisation and delivery of career education and guidance
- approaches to meet the career education and guidance needs of diverse students, including students at risk of leaving school unprepared for the transition to the workplace or further education/training
- career information processes
- professional development for staff specific to career education and guidance
- whānau and community involvement in career education and guidance
- the self review of career education and guidance.

ERO found that 12 percent of secondary schools provided high quality career education and guidance to their students. A further 85 percent were effective in some areas with one secondary school needing to improve across all of the areas.

Although the quantitative evidence suggests that there has been minimal change in the quality of the approach taken to CIAGE by secondary schools, the qualitative data suggests some moderate improvements have been made by New Zealand schools. In particular, use of the career education guidelines and the understanding of career management competencies indicates that, even in the Conventional-Developing schools, there was at least some awareness of the need for students to develop career management competencies and the need for coordinated approaches to CIAGE.

A significant system-wide improvement in the approach taken to CIAGE would require schools to adopt a more innovative whole-school approach focused on student futures. This represents a considerable challenge for schools and policy-makers. The professional development and school-change implications involve a move from an approach based around the work of a careers department to one that involves most, if not all, teachers significantly contributing to CIAGE.

During 2012, ERO will continue to investigate secondary school processes supporting students to develop pathways to success. This investigation will provide further evidence about high quality practices to support students to develop both career management competencies and suitable future pathways.

Appendix 1: Schools' approach to CIAGE - indicator framework

Context	Indicator
The school's approach, to CIAGE	• CIAGE is an essential component of the school and, through CIAGE, the school aims to ensure that **every student** goes on to further education, training or employment (NAG 1(f))
	• The school's vision for careers education and guidance is linked to NEG 1 - The highest standards of achievement, through programmes which enable **all students** to realise their full potential as individuals, and to develop the values needed to become full members of New Zealand's society; and
	• NEG 3 - Development of the knowledge, understanding and skills needed by New Zealanders to compete successfully in the modern, ever-changing world.
	• CIAGE is consistent with effective practice in career education guidelines, including the focus on students developing career management competencies, the need for school-wide team-work/coordination and the personalisation of career advice and guidance
	• The school has processes in place that support the career education and guidance of Māori, Pacific, Special Needs and students at risk of under-achievement
	• The school's approach is widely understood and shared across the school's staff
Curriculum and Pastoral systems	• Careers education and guidance is integrated into each curriculum area and the school's pastoral care systems with ongoing opportunities for students to develop self-awareness and explore options (e.g. enterprise education, career related learning, mentoring, work experience and career planning programmes)
	• The school has a coordinated approach to ensuring that all students develop their career management competencies and leave school on a positive pathway (in line with NEG 1)
	• Links to the other institutions, businesses and the wider community help students to develop self awareness, explore opportunities and plan for their future.
Career management skills or competencies[7] and future pathways	• Each student has an active career plan based around setting goals, exploring options and making decisions
	• Students have a good understanding of their future options and the choices they need to make for their range of possible pathways
	• There is evidence that students increase their understanding of themselves and the pathways available to them as they progress in the

---

[7] See Career Education and Guidance in New Zealand Schools (2009)

	senior school and/or transition from school to employment/training and education
	• Māori, Pacific, Students with special needs and students at risk of under-achievement are effectively developing self awareness, exploring opportunities, and deciding and acting
Individual student support	• The school has processes in place to identify and respond to each students strengths and interests (e.g. individual mentoring, tutor groups, external careers advice, links to the community) • There are effective initiatives in place that support Māori, Pacific, students with special needs and students at risk of under-achievement to develop career plans and competencies. These opportunities build on the language, culture and identity of these students.
Careers information	• All students have access to various careers resources and information that support them to explore options and make decisions
Year 9 and 10 CIAGE programmes	• Build students strengths and interests and consider how these relate to their future life and employment decisions • Junior secondary students are exploring career options as part of their curriculum programme • Junior secondary students have regular opportunities to be involved in curricula and extra-curricular activities that are relevant to future employment and develop their self-awareness, leadership skills and knowledge of the world of work • Students with specific CIAGE needs are identified and provided with additional support in line with their interests/strengths
Junior to senior transitions	• Year 10 students have a career education programme that identifies a student's strengths and interests and informs their Year 11 course selection
Exit transitions	• The school provides all leavers with the career management skills and pathway support they need to succeed in future education, training and employment • Students understand their future options and the choices they need to make for their range of possible pathways
Leadership and management	
Active leadership	• Career education and guidance has high status in the school-with staff, parents and students • Senior leaders actively encourage approaches to curriculum design that develop student career management skills, reflect the principles of NZC and the requirements of the NEGs • Senior leaders and middle managers have a clear understanding of how students will develop career management skills through the curriculum • Expectations are clearly articulated in the service documentation and middle managers ensure that courses reflect the above documents
Careers leaders and	• There are clear roles and responsibilities for careers staff linked to the school's goals for CIAGE

staff	• Careers staff have had the training and experience to ensure that all students can build pathways in line with NEG 1 and the development of an effective, individualised approach to CIAGE
	• Careers staff had adequate resources to build an effective careers education programme for all students, especially Māori, Pacific, special needs and students at risk of under-achievement
	• Departments and individual teachers have the skills, knowledge and support to make the curriculum both relevant to students and structured so that it supports students to help them develop self awareness and explore future options
Specialist providers	• Specialist careers educators/providers help the school provide individualised career development.
Educational Institutions employers and the wider community	• The school has relationships with other educational institutions, employers and the wider community that allow all students opportunities to gain insight into their possible future pathways
Families	• The parents of ALL students are included in processes that help students develop their career competencies and their future possible pathways
	• The parents of ALL students, including Māori and Pacific students are included in a way that affirms their language, culture and identity and helps them to fully understand and support the pathways of their children
Self-review	
The analysis of data	• The school tracks the development of student pathways and/or career management competencies
	• The type of data analysed by the school includes student leaving data, student career plans, achievement data and course selection data
	• The analysis examines the pathways taken by Māori, Pacific, students with special needs and students at risk of under-achievement
Community involvement	• The school community have contributed to the review and planning of CIAGE
The use of data	• Data analysis is used to improve the school's career education and guidance programmes
	• A review of CIAGE is completed each year and involves the school's SMT.